EPS PEAKS Our Expertise. Your Knowledge.

ECONOMIC AND PRIVATE SECTOR

PROFESSIONAL EVIDENCE AND APPLIED KNOWLEDGE SERVICES

HELPDESK REQUEST

TVET and skills training in fragile and conflict affected countries

Claudia Pompa

Overseas Development Institute (ODI)

July 2014

coffey international development · ODI · UNIVERSITY OF BIRMINGHAM · NATHAN · LSE Enterprise · Oxford Policy Management

EPS-PEAKS is a consortium of organisations that provides Economics and Private Sector Professional Evidence and Applied Knowledge Services to the DfID. The core services include:

1) Helpdesk
2) Document library
3) Information on training and e-learning opportunities
4) Topic guides
5) Structured professional development sessions
6) E-Bulletin

To find out more or access EPS-PEAKS services or feedback on this or other output, visit the EPS-PEAKS community on http://partnerplatform.org/eps-peaks or contact Alberto Lemma, Knowledge Manager, EPS-PEAKS core services at a.lemma@odi.org.uk

Contents

1 Introduction

The UK Department for International Development (DfID) has commissioned a literature review on the benefits and return-on-investment for interventions that increase access to skills training/ Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) in fragile and conflict affected countries.

Query 1: What are the benefits and return-on-investment for interventions that increase access to skills training/ TVET in fragile and conflict affected countries and lead to jobs?

This literature review examines the existing evidence of the benefits of providing TVET in fragile and conflict affected countries. The paper provides a conceptual framework for employability and describes some of the main characteristics of training under conflict scenarios. It then proceeds to analyse the existing data and provides a summary of some of the emerging best practices and lessons learnt on the topic. The annex provides a sample of evaluations of TVET and skills development programmes in different fragile countries that can help provide further insights on the issue.

2 Methodology

The approach taken by this literature review includes conducting a broad-based search of relevant content, based on main focus of the paper and lessons learnt, keeping a strict record of search strategies and inclusion/exclusion criteria such as time frame, focus of the paper, methodology, etc. The literature review covers the academic literature, research and technical papers, government reports and working papers which are considered to be useful to answer the main research questions.

The list of documents reviewed is by no means exhaustive; it represents material available online or through data bases. The selection criteria were broadly defined as any text reviewing, analysing, evaluating or describing educational and training programmes in protracted crisis, post-crisis or recovery.

Although the body of evidence about the benefits of TVET has increased over the years there is lack of robust evidence to conclude that TVET delivers on its central goal – to improve the incomes of the beneficiaries. Most of the studies provide information at the output (number of people trained) and outcome level (higher level of skills) but neglect to provide detail information about impact (jobs and incomes) and evidence on quality or income or sustainability of jobs gained after training; furthermore very few studies assess the cost of training.

The term *impact* is used only colloquially, as rigorous research on education and training in fragile and conflict-affected states is limited. With only a handful of methodical external impact evaluations, the review relies mostly on observational research and the 'grey literature'.

Questions of gender and age are inadequately considered in the literature, and—at least in their presentation, data are rarely disaggregated by sex and even less so by sub-categories of age.

The review considers only reports written in English.

3 Literature review

Overall, fragile states and conflict-affected countries are characterized by recurring cycle of disenchantment and violence, particularly among youth, that compromises the recovery and long-term stability of communities. Growing youth populations in conflict-prone states are often disconnected from educational and employment opportunities, leaving them susceptible to recruitment and participation in armed conflict. Competing priorities in conflict-ravaged states often leaves education and employability behind in favour of immediate returns, which perpetuates the cycle of violence. Armed conflict has the potential to devastate not only the livelihoods but also the education prospects of those affected, perpetuating their fragility in post-conflict settings. While providing education and training in these settings presents numerous challenges, it is essential for the recovery and long-term stability of communities and countries (INEE, 2011). The youth demographic is an increasing portion of this world, and will be most affected by conflict and recovery in the coming years.

Over half of the world's population is under the age of 30, and this is only expected to increase (USAID 2012). In 2010, over a billion young people—aged 14-25—lived in developing countries, many with precarious educational opportunities (UNESCO 2012). The lack of education is a serious problem for young people, and it is further aggravated in fragile states—42% of the world's population of children who do not attend school live in countries affected by conflict and fragility (Save the Children 2012a). Again in 2010, 71 million adolescents worldwide did not attend school—three out of four of these youth live in South and West Asia or sub-Saharan Africa, with a majority of the population in countries affected by violent conflict (UNESCO 2012). While a large portion of these youth should be in school, enrolment rates for secondary schools were nearly one-third lower in 2008 in conflict-affected fragile states than those in other low-income countries (48% compared to 67%), with an even lower rate of attendance for girls and young women (UNESCO 2011). The literacy rate for youth mirrors these statistics—79% in conflict-affected states versus 93% in other developing countries (UNESCO 2011). The context of conflict has bred this situation—youth, having grown up during war and fragility, are often unable to access education. Almost all have been affected by the fighting, whether by participating in the conflict, being prevented from attending school because of fear of abduction or violence, attending schools that were closed or destroyed, or being forced to leave their local communities. In these situations, school attendance suffers, as mere survival becomes a feat unto itself.

The status quo idea that marginalized and disadvantaged youth—those without access to relevant education, training, and livelihoods—exacerbate the cycle of conflict and instability has long been acknowledged in policy and academic circles. Recently, however, many authors have refuted this view, instead arguing that youth should be seen as a tremendous asset to all societies (INEE, 2011). When education, health and employment are available, young people have the capacity to renew and revitalise a country's economy and institutions (INEE, 2011). Across a spectrum of different conflicts and contexts, education for children and youth remains one of the highest priorities (INEE/UNESCO/IEEP 2011 a,b,c,d,e, UNICEF 2011). Education is perceived to help restore normalcy to society and to provide returns that conflict dismantled and made nearly impossible

These returns—and the specific needs and abilities of youth—have often been lost amidst the competing priorities in post-war transitions, despite evidence of the severe effects of war on youth and the documented risks and potentials inherent in their agency (INEE 2011). Typically, humanitarian assistance has focused on the urgent health and nutrition needs of the population, with a special emphasis on those under-five and primary school-age children, which has made the youth group less likely to receive assistance or protection during conflict, despite the evident vulnerabilities (UNICEF, 2004). Research conducted by Chaffin (2009) mentions that an overview of World Bank lending to conflict-affected

countries in 2005 found that less than 8% of lending was directed specifically to secondary education projects, compared to 43% for primary and 12% for tertiary education. Funding for emergency programmes explicitly targeting young women and men—especially those who are not in school—remains scarce. This complex issue gets even worse in refugee settings, where only 5% of all refugee students are in secondary school, 6% in non-formal education programmes and 3% in vocational or tertiary education programmes—a majority of youth in these settings receive almost no assistance whatsoever (World Bank, 2005).

The lack of funding for educational opportunities for youth is countermanded by the mounting evidence of the benefits of education. In Liberia, livelihood training is recognised as an important means to reduce fragility—increased quality education reduces conflict, and specifically for boys, each additional year of schooling reduces the risk of becoming involved in conflict by 20% (Save the Children 2010, Petersen 2013). However, if there are no jobs, even for those with education, the only option for young people may be joining a rebellion (Petersen 2013). This is crucially important, as education is a barometer of the relationship between the state and its citizens (Rose and Greely 2006), and re-establishing education after a conflict can (re)establish the legitimacy of the state, but if both education and the state leave young people without opportunities, the state can be seen as illegitimate or incapable.

As well, poorly planned programmes or undertakings that misinterpret on-the-ground realities often exacerbate the difficulties in fostering legitimate, useful education. Unfortunately, access to education and training in conflict affected areas often neglects the different needs or different populations; for example, when youth manage to access education programs, they are typically grouped either with younger children or with older adults, where they may not belong. Where effort is made to provide age-appropriate programmes, the curriculum may not be appropriate for the realities of females and males, or youth living in situations of conflict or disaster (Chaffin, 2009). Access to 'second-chance' or non-formal educational options prove beneficial to many youth, fostering a sense of confidence and employability, yet governments tend to see these approaches as less legitimate than formal schooling and tend to de-prioritize them, thereby widening the gap between employable skills and youth education (Chaffin 2009).

It's important to note that the scarcity of program experience and long-term data makes it difficult to known which education and training programmes are most effective in crisis contexts. This review aims to analyse the existing evidence and provide some guidance about best practices and lessons learnt.

3.1 A conceptual framework

As a growing number of countries move towards achieving the goal of universal primary education, they are now developing a pipeline of young people who expect to pursue either further education and/or training in order to improve their chances for employment and higher earnings. Structural changes in the economy, furthered by urbanization, technology, and shifting patterns of consumer demand, have created demands on adults already in or actively seeking jobs in the workforce to develop skills that enable them to compete in this new environment (Adams, 2011). Overall, the structure and interplay of work and education has changed.

It's important to note that the preparation of youth and adults for employment has shifted from the concept of formal education to that of skills development. Within the policy realm, skills development, technical and vocational education and training (TVET), life skills and livelihoods training are concepts that are used often interchangeably, it is good to provide clear specifications of what each concept entails.

Technical and Vocational Education and Training: The International Standard Classification of Education (ISCED) defines TVET as "education which is mainly designed to lead participants to acquire the practical skills, know-how and understanding necessary

for employment in a particular occupation, trade or group of occupations or trades" (UNESCO, 1997). UNESCO's Centre for Technical and Vocational Education and Training's (UNESCO-UNEVOC, 2007) argues this definition is too restrictive in the context of post-conflict reconstruction where TVET programming is often tied to goals of reintegration, economic stimulation, physical reconstruction and recovery. UNESCO-UNEVOC proposes a broader definition in scope, stating simply that: "TVET is concerned with the acquisition of knowledge and skills for the world of work" (UNESCO-UNEVOC, 2007). However, the organisation also acknowledges that this definition falls short of addressing the multifaceted set of challenges faced by learners in post-conflict contexts, wherein economies are often dysfunctional and livelihoods must be built alongside or before employability.

UNESCO-UNEVOC, (2007) argues that a broad, flexible and responsive understanding of TVET is essential in post-conflict settings given the multitude of challenges facing conflict-affected populations. UNESCO-UNEVOC also believes that TVET programming in a post-conflict context could and often should act as a carrier for services that have not traditionally been considered to fall within the scope of TVET. Therefore, the Conflict and Education Research Group (CERG) has developed a working definition of a holistic approach to TVET that takes into account the number of challenges facing conflict-affected populations: '*TVET is a learning system in which both "soft" and "hard" skills are developed within a "joined-up", integrated development and delivery framework that seeks to improve livelihoods, promote inclusion into the world of work and that supports community and individual agency'* (UNESCO-UNEVOC, 2007).

Usually, livelihoods and TVET training also include training in the "soft skills" or employability skills such as job-seeking, business and money management skills. Through these types of training participants can obtain the capabilities, resources and opportunities to pursue individual and household economic goals (INEE, 2011).

Skills development and training: According to Adams (2011), the term skills development is used to describe a wider array of institutions and activities influencing employment and earnings. Skill training is the education or training designed to provide the participant with the basic skills and certification necessary for employment in an occupational area.

While access to secondary and tertiary education remains important, so does access to technical and vocational education. Furthermore, attention extends to informal learning on the job, structured apprenticeships and other enterprise-based training, along with government and non-governmental training programs.

Adams (2011) regards skills development as a much broader concept involving a larger, more diverse provider community, and as a result, development is more difficult to monitor. Skills development is far more complicated than simply counting net enrolment rates or years of formal schooling attained. Skills acquired at later stages of the lifecycle after completing formal education come from a variety of sources that are more difficult to track and measure in quantity and quality terms. Moreover, the variety of competencies that employers seek, as well as the different sources by which they are acquired, make them difficult to assess. While marginalisation in education is measured in terms of attainment of years of formal education, marginalization in skills has no uniform indicator (Adams, 2011). For example, people who do not have access to TVET may otherwise gain the necessary skills through apprenticeships, training centres and other enterprise-based training, which often operate outside the formal education system maintained by the government.

Livelihoods: According to INEE (2011) and USAID (2005), livelihoods are composed of the physical, natural, human, financial, social and political capabilities, assets and activities required for households to obtain and maintain access to the resources necessary to ensure their immediate and long-term survival. For Chaffin (2010), the term livelihoods training refers to training in fields of lower-skilled, especially informal types of work in

mostly home-based or "cottage" industries: sewing, knitting, vegetable gardening, and the like.

Life skills: These skills, often referred to as 'soft skills,' fall into three basic categories: 1) Social or interpersonal skills which may include communication, negotiation, assertiveness, cooperation, etc.; 2) Cognitive skills such as problem solving, understanding consequences, decision making, critical thinking, etc; and 3) Emotional coping skills which included positive sense of self, self-control, managing stress, etc. (USAID, 2013)

Fragile states: according to the OECD (2012) a fragile region or state has weak capacity to carry out basic governance functions, and lacks the ability to develop mutually constructive relations with society. Fragile states are also more vulnerable to internal or external shocks such as economic crises or natural disasters. More resilient states exhibit the capacity and legitimacy of governing a population and its territory. They can manage and adapt to changing social needs and expectations, shifts in elite and other political agreements, and growing institutional complexity. Fragility and resilience should be seen as shifting points along a spectrum

3.2 Training in a conflict scenario

Deploying the previous conceptual framework in conflict and post-conflict settings is crucial to aid recovery and to avoid relapse. The longer the crisis period extends, the more important it becomes to equip citizens with the right set of skills that will allow them to make a meaningful contribution to their local communities during the recovery period. The lack of viable livelihoods or inequitable access to resources is a primary factor motivating violence, and offering livelihood support can avert conflict (USAID, 2005). As stated by UNESCO-UNEVOC (2007): 'Providing vocational and livelihood opportunities that connect directly to opportunities either in employment or in community reconstruction could certainly be seen as demonstrable outcomes of a peace process and provide incentive for continued peace by providing alternatives to those previously involved in conflict.'

TVET has been seen as a necessary component in order to ensure the sustainable development of whole communities (INEE, 2011). TVET allows students access to vocational and professional training, as well as apprenticeship programmes to help them acquire entry-level jobs and adjust to changes in labour demand. TVET has also been seen as a critical step in obtaining the necessary skills to help secure wage employment, gain self-esteem and become active citizens (Moberg and Johnson-Demen, 2009). TVET in fragile situations tends to be short term (1-10 months) in design, particularly when necessary to apply in situations of emergency or fragility, where programmes are aimed at displaced youth, former combatants or others suffering from the war and in need of immediate assistance to gain a livelihood. Typically, the training offered focuses on a locally well-developed field in which artisans are already active and often involves sewing, bicycle repair, mechanics, basket-making, weaving, masonry or carpentry. The main goals of these programmes are to address an immediate income need, to help build the human capital necessary for reconstruction, to provide a tangible peace dividend and to provide participants with the promise of a better future. Because of its short-term and targeted nature, TVET programmes provide certain advantages over formal education (UNESCO-UNEVOC 2007).

Linking training to economic opportunities

It is important to acknowledge that a common concern about TVET relates to out-dated curricula, which is often out-of-touch with current market needs. Unfortunately, in multiple occasions, participants have been trained in skills for which there is no demand, leading to labour market saturation (INEE, 2011). The disconnect between training and employment opportunities is perhaps the most significant failure of existing post-conflict TVET initiatives (UNESCO-UNEVOC 2007). Petersen (2013) highlights that for livelihood's training to have a positive impact training should be designed after a thorough market

analysis and close examination of local needs and trainer capabilities, as well as in alliance with local authorities and with the involvement of the local community.

Another crucial component to ensure training is linked to economic opportunities is the involvement of local businesses to fund skills training according to their needs and to provide apprenticeship opportunities and employment after training ends. While many donors and implementing partners now understand this crucial element, many practices still need to be changed accordingly (Petersen, 2013). Support campaigns that aim to enhance the status of manual work can also increase the acceptance of TVET-trained young people and increase financial support.

Delivery mechanisms

In terms of delivery mechanisms, UNESCO-UNEVOC (2007) divides TVET provision in three main categories: public or national training programmes financed by governments, training offered in private institutions, and training funded by non-governmental organizations (NGOs) or international organizations.

Government funded and/or operated training programs tend to vary not only across countries but also depending on context, i.e., urban and rural. Public TVET programmes may or may not charge fees, which are nominal when extant; however, even minimal fees can limit accessibility to the most vulnerable. Public TVET programmes often require completion of basic primary education, which could also prevent enrolment, especially of those adversely affected by conflict.

Private skills training institutions usually charge fees. Private TVET institutions usually take on the role of filling the gap between the supply and demand for TVET programming. However, as mentioned before, fees can act as a limiting factor for enrolment.

Training programmes funded by local NGOs and international agencies usually do not charge any fees and often target vulnerable groups, such as the disabled. Because national training institutes hardly exist on fragile states, TVET programmes are usually run by international or local NGOs.

Costs and sustainability

The cost of providing vocational training is highly linked to the type of training being offered. Overall, vocational training is much more costly than providing basic education and therefore rarely forms part of the education system. In order to have lasting impact, support to TVET needs to be at least medium-term, if not long-term.

Sustainability of training programmes is a huge concern for those involved in vocational training. Under the typical model, an NGO operating a skills training programme will construct one centre in a community, and, during the life of the project cycle, fund both material inputs and instructor salaries; the NGO will also attempt to establish an income-generating project to ensure sustainability of the centre. When the project ends, these centres are usually turned over to communities or, more often, to ministries of education. Centres turned over to communities or ministries of education are rarely able to benefit from the income generating activities in order to sustain their operations, which in turn leads to increase in fees. Even in rare cases where projects turned over to the ministries receive government support, over the years they usually undergo budget cuts and are forced to minimize support to cover only instruction but no other input costs, thereby drastically reducing the efficacy of training. A few exceptions exist, such as Don Bosco, where the organization continues to operate the centres in perpetuity, but most fall into the previous described process (UNESCO-UNEVOC, 2007).

Because of the high costs associated with training, coverage tends to be limited. Training programmes are expensive in terms of time, commitment, methodology, curriculum and support structures, making them difficult to be replicated on a broader scale. Petersen (2013) affirms that although most programmes are endorsed by the education system, there are no examples of coherent and coordinated approaches to skills training in fragile

situations. This situation largely explains why implementation is undertaken mostly by international and large local NGOs, whose approaches and costs vary greatly.

To date, the data has not been indicative of the return over investment in TVET, especially in conflict affected countries. This is probably related to a series of issues, including the difficulties in measuring skills development. Formal education and enrolments in technical and vocational education at secondary and tertiary levels can often be used as a proxy for skills development. However, this captures only a part of the larger skills development picture and may actually distort the picture in some cases where other sources of skills are substituted for formal education. Often times programs vary in duration, quality and level of skills offered making measurement of skills and its associated costs especially in the non-formal sector, complicated

If the increased focus of many donors on employment is to have a serious impact, it requires considerable increase in funding. Petersen (2013) warns donors to be careful in selecting the right partners when implementing training since programmes are expensive. Nonetheless, it may well be worth the cost when TVET succeeds in creating employment and at the same time provides 'soft skills' that enable young people to reintegrate into their society and therein be accepted as important members.

3.3 What the evidence shows

Petersen (2013) argues that outcomes of vocational and skills training programmes are often mixed, but that programmes which combine basic life-skills with technical training, internships or apprenticeships and further support in entering the job market or starting a business, have *significantly improved employment opportunities.* Research conducted by several authors, including Attanasio et al. (2009), and Project Baobab (2009) have shown similar results: When vocational training is combined with work placement, life skills training and microcredit, it can lead participants to formulate clear future objectives, secure employment and/or establish a business.

Most training programmes offered to populations in crisis- and conflict-affected environments aim to provide them with useful skills that quickly improve their employability. According to USAID (2013) in studies conducted by Blattman and Annan (2011), Cook and Younis (2012), IYF (2011), Janke, et.al., (2012), Mercy Corps (2012) and YouthBuild (2010), results have shown that youth in particular are more likely to gain employment or become self-employed after participating in holistic programs that include some kind of vocational or entrepreneurship training. The studies have also shown that post-training, youth are better prepared to find employment through internships and/or operate small businesses or farms. The study conducted by Hamilton et al. (2011) showed increased numbers of youth gain vocational certificates as a result of workforce training.

Save the Children's "Skills training for employment opportunities" project in Somalia is one of the more successful programmes in terms of getting youth into jobs. The two-year project, funded by the European Commission, aimed to provide 5,100 disadvantaged young people with vocational training linked to job opportunities. Almost all young people indicated that they had become employed or started their own businesses. A tracer study confirmed that, of the young people taking part in the education, 67% in Somaliland and 68% in Puntland are in sustainable employment (Petersen, 2013).

An evaluation of the USAID-funded Somalia Youth Livelihood program (Shaqodoon), conducted by Cook and Younis (2012) found that a high majority of youth participants (78 percent) who received vocational training were placed in jobs with local employers. In addition, 52 percent of youth who received the program's entrepreneurship training started a business or were placed in other employment opportunities.

According to USAID (2013), life skills training has resulted in overall increased self-awareness and empathy, as well as decision making, goal setting and communications skills, particularly for youth. Studies conducted by Fauth and Daniels (2011), IYF (2011),

Mercy Corps (2012), Nordveit (2005) and others have shown the positive impact of employability and life skills training. Skills that help make participants marketable in the local economies, such as information and communication technology (ICT), the ability to job search, and those related to entrepreneurship (e.g. budgeting, marketing, organization), were found to be particularly effective. Positive findings were confirmed in Kenya, Nigeria, Senegal and Tanzania, where 62 to 98 percent of participants in Microsoft's Youth Empowerment Program reported that the program's ICT training positively affected their employment prospects (IYF, 2011). The USAID-funded Support for Kosovo's Young Leader (SKYL) program for adults and youth not only increased life and employability skills, but also led to better communication and relationship-building abilities after participation (Mercy Corps, 2012). This intervention included multiple components such as life skills training, entrepreneurship training, mentoring, apprenticeships, and civic engagement.

Several studies (BRAC, 2011; Fauth & Daniels, 2001; Janke, et.al., 2012; YouthBuild, 2010) have also showed youth re-enrolling in education or participating in vocational training programs as a result of programming that included interventions such as basic education, life skills training, vocational training, etc.

In terms of gender, a research conducted by Ghati (2008) found that targeted youth livelihood programmes do not generally reach adolescent girls, especially those most in need. Unless programs put girls at the centre from the beginning, they do not "get" to girls.

Although employment increases income and assets, it is important to mention that most evaluations did not examine the impact of education and training programs on income or asset levels, and those that did found mixed results (Blattman and Annan, 2011; BRAC, 2011; Buj, et. al., 2003). The study conducted by Blattman and Annan (2011) found an increase in household durable assets, but not in income or savings, when they studied a holistic program for high-risk youth in Liberia that included vocational training, life skills training, psychosocial education, basic education, etc. On the other hand, the Organization of Migration's support program for ex-combatant children in Colombia and BRAC's Microfinance Multiplied program in Uganda showed direct increases in income and savings after similar kinds of interventions (Buj, et. al., 2003; BRAC, 2011). The BRAC study also reported that females saved less, but most other studies did not disaggregate findings by gender (BRAC, 2011).

Some scholars question the allocation of substantive resources to skills training for conflict affected youth as a productive peace building measure, citing the high cost and modest demonstrated gains in social stability and reductions in male aggression

Impact of TVET

Petersen (2013) summarises a few of the benefits or impacts that TVET can achieve in youth populations:

Young people's self-esteem is positively influenced by the training: Petersen summarises that the main benefit of TVET in youth populations is not simply the knowledge and skills, but the feeling of "becoming someone" in the eyes of the community—this has a powerful effect on reducing the likelihood of future conflict.

After successful TVET, young people become less aggressive, and violence in the local society is markedly reduced. Programmes reviewed by Petersen, mainly conducted in South Sudan and Liberia, found this result to be emphasized by both young people and their communities. Many of these programmes are run in communities in which there is a mixture of former combatants, returnees, refugees and other vulnerable groups, and the impact of increased peaceful coexistence cannot be overstated.

Through this coexistence and feeling of belonging, young people start to *better contribute to their local society* after matriculating through holistic programmes. Not only do they

find employment and earn money, but they use other acquired skills to improve conditions in their locality, increase their social involvement, and participate in voluntary support programs.

3.4 Emerging best practices and lessons learnt

The need for hard and soft skills and holistic approaches

A holistic approach can help ensure the relevance and recovery for conflict-affected participants. Programmes which include vocational skills accompanied by literacy, numeracy and life skills training, entrepreneurship training and provision of start-up kits to facilitate transition from training into the labour market have proven to be particularly successful. Integrated approaches also have been shown to have positive effects on youth engagement and leadership, which in turn lead to empowerment of their local communities. It is crucial that training programmes remain flexible enough to cope with the changing realities of a crisis context but at the same time are structured enough to provide effective evaluation (INEE, 2011).

People in conflict situations often face uncertain futures that include scenarios like repatriation or resettlement in another country. In this context, an emphasis on transferable skills is a must.

Holistic approaches require inclusion of post-training linkages such as linking the strategy for youth employment promotion to a macro policy to promote economic growth. Youth equipped with the right set of skills have can become positive actors in community reconstruction and reinforce those linkages (INEE, 2011). Programmes building on less holistic approaches and lacking in follow-up linkages, as for example the USAID-supported Training for Employment in Liberia, also seem to have less impact (Petersen, 2013).

Market studies should be at the forefront of the intervention with flexible programmes able to adapt changing needs.

Conducting local market analysis is crucial to decide what skills to offer in a programme, to identify trainers and to ensure the training needs are not already covered by other businesses. Conducting market analysis could also prevent a saturation of the market in the skills which are being provided. Training programmes should be demand-driven rather than supply led. The involvement of local businesses when selecting the relevant skills helps ensure their commitment to apprenticeships and employment after training (Petersen, 2013).

Basing training with local artisans and using local people as supervisors is another mechanism that has proven to be not only cost–efficient, but also helps build networks and relations by acknowledging and appreciating professional skills. By understanding the local environment and connecting programmes to the community, TVET can avoid failures such as the following example: A World Bank-supported Liberian government initiative to combine the repair and maintenance of infrastructure with employment generation was initially successful, as it created short-term employment to many TVET-trained youth. However, since the project was short-term, and the skills learned were not useful post-completion, the initiative fostered frustration and anger rather than jobs (UNESCO-UNEVOC, 2007).

TVET programmes must be relevant, context-specific and demand-based

As the example above demonstrates, vocational training in conflict situations must be adapted to the local context and needs. By using local knowledge and capacity, building on local structures and organizations, and ensuring support of local and national institutions, programmes can have a greater impact. Those that are locally supported, financially viable, and developed with a clear articulation of national socio-economic goals are more likely to succeed than programmes which take a "cookie cutter" approach to implementation (INEE, 2011).

Involvement of local communities

Successful programmes were also characterised by a strong involvement of the local community, which helps ensure that family and community members not only support the program but also promote participation. Integrated or holistic programmes tend to be quite intensive, often running classes both in the morning and afternoon, and leaving little time for work during training periods. Families need to support this, which might represent a challenge in poor and fragile contexts (Petersen, 2013).

UNESCO-UNEVOC (2007) highlights the case of Uganda as a rare example where returning combatants often have the full support of their families and communities to enrol in TVET programmes, thus making community-based TVET projects very successful. In cases where support from either the community or family structure is lacking, TVET programmes are less likely to succeed.

Targeting girls

The support from family members and local community is particularly important in the case of girls, who often have responsibilities are home or are prevented from attaining training (Petersen, 2013).

INEE (2011) brings attention to the issue of female inclusion and states than in order to attain gender parity in programming, girl friendly approaches need to be employed. Women will be reluctant to enrol in courses where employment is mainly male-dominated, and even if they do, they will face discrimination in the labour force. Actions on the demand side of the labour force could help tackle this issue and encourage women to enter non-traditional fields. Special attention should be put to the safety and security of female participants, including the training environment and routes to and from training.

Ensure that TVET receives long-term support

Recovery from conflict is not a short-term process, nor should be TVET programmes. However, as previously discussed, TVET in fragile situations tends to be perceived as short-term projects run by NGOs with little capacity to ensure sustainability. To develop the required community and national support, many TVET programmes need to focus on long-term effects. Through cooperation and close ties to the government, TVET programmes can gain acceptance and encourage take-over and possible replication by ministries while retaining external funding. UNESCO-UNEVOC (2007) suggest this might be accomplished by supporting the building of a national training institute and facilitating the formulation of national policies regarding employable skills.

The most important take-away regarding vocational training is the short timeline and practicality in supporting youth who have been most severely affected by fragility and conflict. TVET programmes can help reduce the chance of further conflict by ensuring youth have real employable skills and are able to find work with those skills. By becoming part of the community, youth are less likely to commit violence within it, and are more closely tied to local success. However, TVET is by far the most expensive form of youth education, and is handicapped by weak coordination and integration into local and national education systems.

4 Conclusion

Several evaluations have shown that holistic and well-designed TVET programmes have the potential to significantly improve the livelihoods and employment opportunities of people. Associated benefits include not only employment and income but also improvements to self-esteem and standing in local communities, reduced aggressive behaviour and localized violence, larger positive contributions to local society post-enrolment and positive changes in gender relations. However, it is important to note that based on the existing data is hard to calculate the exact return over investment of funding TVET.

As previously discussed, training programmes are expensive in terms of time, commitment, methodology, curriculum and support structures, making them difficult to be replicated on a broader scale but they may well be worth the cost when TVET succeeds in creating employment and at the same time provides 'soft skills' that enable young people to reintegrate into their society and therein be accepted as important members.

References

Adams, A. (2011), *The Role of Skills Development in Overcoming Social Disadvantage*. Education for All Global Monitoring Report 2012. UNESCO.

Attanasio, O. P., Kugler, A. D. and Meghir, C. (2009), *Subsidizing Vocational Training for Disadvantaged Youth in Developing Countries: Evidence from a Randomized Trial*. London, Houston: University College London, University of Houston, IFS, NBER and CEPR.

Blattman, C. & Annan, J. (2011). *Reintegrating and employing high risk youth in Liberia: Lessons from a randomized evaluation of a landmine action: An agricultural training program for ex-combatants*. New Haven, CT: Innovations for Poverty Action

BRAC (2011). *Baseline report for the evaluation of BRAC Uganda's 'Microfinance Multiplied' Approach*. Uganda, Kampala: BRAC

Buj, V., Jimenez, P., Kahn-Sriber, C., Locker, R., Lozano, A., Moorhead, J. & Sklar, J. (2003). *From prevention to reintergration: An evaluation of IOM's summport program for ex-combatant children in Colombia.* Geneva, Switzerland: IOM.

Chaffin, J. (2009), *INEE Thematic Issue Brief: Youth*. Inter-Agency Network for Education in Emergencies.

Chaffin, J. (2010), INEE 2010 Policy Roundtable: Framing Paper 1: Education and Opportunity: Post- Primary and Income Growth

Cook, G., & Younis, A. (2012). *Somali youth livelihood final evaluation.* Washington, D.C: USAID

Fauth, G. & Daniels, B. (2001). *Impact evaluation: youth reintegration training and education for peace (YRTEP) program.* Washington, D.C.: USAID.

Ghati, D., Reinhardt, F. (2009). *Adolescent Girls Programming and Capacity-Building Workshop*, Nairobi: Population Council.

Hamilton, M., Hamilton, S. & Greenwood, D. (2011, January). *Opening pathways: Youth in Latin America.* Ithaca, NY: Cornell University.

INEE (2011). *Education for crisis-affected youth: a literature review*, INEE Adolescent and Youth Taskforce Team.

INEE/UNESCO/IIEP (2011a). *Understanding education's role in fragility. Synthesis of four situational analyses of education and fragility: Afghanistan, Bosnia and Herzegovina, Cambodia, Liberia*. IIEP Research Papers, UNESCO/IIEP.

INEE/UNESCO/IIEP (2011b). *Education and fragility in Afghanistan: a situational analysis*. IIEP research papers.

INEE/UNESCO/IIEP (2011c). *Education and fragility in Cambodia*. IIEP research papers.

INEE/UNESCO/IIEP (2011d). *Education and fragility in Liberia*. IIEP research papers.

INEE/UNESCO/IIEP (2011e). *Education and fragility in Bosnia-Herzegovina*. IIEP research papers

IYF. (2011). *Youth empowerment program evaluation*. Baltimore, M.D.: IYF

Moberg, L. and A. Johnson-Demen (2009). *Evaluation Report: 'Small-small steps' to rebuild communities with YEP: NRC Youth Education Pack Project in Liberia: Post Graduates and Income Generating Activities*. Oslo, Norwegian Refugee Council.

Nordtveit, B. H. (2005). *Country case study: Literacy in Senegal.* Paris, France: United Nations Educational, Scientific, and Cultural Organization (UNSECO).

OECD (2012), *The Missing Piece: Improving International Support to the Peace Process*, Paris: OECD.

Project Baobab. (2009), *Teaching Kenyan Youth Skills for Independence*. Nairobi: Project Baobab.

Rose, P. and M. Greeley (2006). *Education in Fragile States: Capturing Lessons and Identifying Good Practice*. DAC Fragile States Group, Service Delivery Workstream.

Save the Children (2010). *The Future is Now: Education for Children in Countries Affected by Conflict*. London: Save the Children UK

Save the Children. (2010). *Accelerated learning programmes in conflict-affected fragile states*. Policy Brief, Save the Children.

UNESCO (1997), International Standard Classification of Education. UNESCO

UNESCO-UNEVOC (2007). *Education for Livelihoods and Civic Participation in Post-Conflict Countries.* Discussion paper series (3). Bonn: UNESCO-UNEVOC

UNESCO (2011). *The hidden crisis: armed conflict and education*. Education For All Global Monitoring Report 2011. Paris: UNESCO.

UNESCO-UNEVOC (2012). *TVET in situations of post-conflict and post-disaster*. Report of the UNESCO-UNEVOC online conference, UNESCO-UNEVOC.

UNHCR (2003), *World Refugee Day 2003: Information Kit.* Geneva: UNHCR.

UNICEF (2004), *Adolescent programming experiences during conflict and post-conflict - CASE STUDIES.* New York: UNICEF.

UNICEF (2011). *The role of education in peace building: a synthesis report of findings from Lebanon, Nepal and Sierra Leone*. New York: UNICEF.

USAID (2005). *Livelihoods and Conflict, A Toolkit for Intervention*. Washington, DC: USAID

USAID (2012). *Youth in Development: realising the demographic opportunity*. USAID Policy. Washington D.C.: USAID

USAID (2013), *State of the Field Report: Examining the Evidence in Youth Education in Crisis and Conflict*. Washington D.C.: USAID

World Bank (2005), *Reshaping the Future: Education and Post-conflict Reconstruction.* Washington, DC: The World Bank.

YouthBuild. (2010). *Executive summary: Follow-up study of the Central American youth builders program.* Somerville, MA: Author.

Youth Employment Inventory (2014) Accessed June 2014 http://www.youth-employment-inventory.org/

Annex

Name of the intervention and country	Intervention components	Short description of the intervention	Results of the evaluation
Life (LFL) project – Afghanistan (USAID, 2013)	Classroom vocational skills training Health education Basic education Institutional capacity building	LFL project that trained 8,500 women (age 24) and older girls (age 19) to become community health workers. It was implemented by Management Sciences for Health and funded by USAID.	A project performance evaluation conducted by Anastacio in 2006 found that 90% of participants taking a third grade equivalency test passed it after the project, 91% of participants taking a sixth grade equivalency test passed it after the project and 98% of participants passed a health knowledge test after the project. Many of the women reported sharing the health information that they learned in class with their families. All participants were women or girls. Cost Effectiveness: Data provided by the implementing partners indicates that LFL went above targets with more than 8,000 learners enrolled in 361 Foundation Program classes, exceeding targets by 60%, and more than 500 learners registered in 28 Bridging classes, exceeding targets by 50%. From cost-effectiveness viewpoint, initially LFL projected about $720/learner, but by end of program, it was approximately $370/learner.
Legal Aid and Vocational Training for Afghan Refugees and Support to Host Communities in Pakistan (INEE, 2011)	Skills training Functional literacy programs Professional counselling Health education	assess impact of the project that responds to some of the long standing major needs through providing marketable skills trainings and reliable employment-related information upon repatriation as well as working with the refugees for their legal rights realisation to improve the skills of young Afghans to make informed decisions about repatriation and also facilitation in gaining marketable skills to find employment after repatriation; functional literacy programs, professional counselling and health	Project has provided services to more than 1,800 Afghan male and female refugees; programme reached the core of economically vulnerable sections of the Afghan refugeecommunity with women in majority and provided them real chance for economic as well as psychological rehabilitation; significantly more women gained employment (59% versus 34% for men) reflecting relatively more relevance in terms of their market demand, trainings typically imparted were tailoring or sewing, TBA, Computer, Receptionists, Accounting and traditional birth attendance; integration of rights related messages in skill centres have achieved a significant success with majority of the participants registering and accepting the rights based world view; for most of the Afghan community especially for women, trainings have provided them their first real chance for personal development which they wanted to continue; participants are not likely to repatriate soon simply as a result of vocational training alone, but if peace returns and demand for labour improves in Afghanistan, a significant portion of people are now equipped with marketable skills.

		education components are also added for women; attempts a different course in an otherwise very relief centred tradition of working with Afghan refugees in the region	Training curriculum was good in meeting the requirement of the minimum learning needs of the participants and yet it did not account for students with low learning abilities: given the poor educational background and low educational attainment level of some of refugees, 77% of participants found course duration too short; community based approach failed to develop sustainable community structures: should have focused more on working with the community to develop long term development goals, train them to develop their organisations and facilitating them in managing it financially and programmatically on sustainable bases; the actual project design did not include some of the key activities in the area of policy advocacy and development of inter-communitarian associational life between Afghans and host communities; the scattered nature of activities in the host communities undermined its societal level visibility; the separate activity level achievements by the consortium partners could never establish a singular programmatic and organisational identity which could have helped in forging larger civil society coalition over the issue to affect refugee policy meaningfully; the combined effect of these factors, as a result, limited the project impact
Somalia Youth Livelihood Program (Shaqodoon) –Somalia (USAID, 2013)	Basic education (accelerated learning) Life skills General training on entrepreneurship Access to youth friendly loans or stock Financial literacy Apprenticeships or on-the-job training Job match and mediation Mentoring ICT	The Somalia Youth Livelihood Program (Shaqodoon) was targeted at building employment skills of youth ages 15-24. ICT was a prominent program feature. The program was implemented by EDC and funded by USAID. The programme served a total of 10,573 youth with a completion rate of 87%	The independent evaluation conducted by Cook and Younis (2012) found that 78% of youth participants who received vocational training were placed with outside employers and 52% of those in entrepreneurship training were placed in businesses/employment. More than 50% of youth attributed their employment placement to the program. More than 60% said that skills attained as a result of the training improve their prospects for future employment or self-employment. Parents commented on how the program helped to create a sense of hope and improve in their children's morale. Interviews with parents and other stakeholders consistently indicated that provision of education and training was paramount to improving security and stability of their communities. Innovative ICTs in a developing country context present numerous challenges that can take time to overcome. Nevertheless, the benefits of ICT outweighed the disadvantages. The numbers reached would not have been possible without the use of ICTs including cellular phones. About 41% of enrolees in entrepreneurship training were females. The completion rate among females (90%) was slightly higher than that of males (85%). Females were under-represented in the vocational training component (37%). In a post-survey, the average monthly income for female graduates was US$83, while male graduates earned a monthly average of US$141.

Support for Kosovo's Young Leaders (SKYL) – Kosovo (USAID, 2013)	Institutional capacity building Life skills General training on entrepreneurship Apprenticeships or on-the-job training Access to youth friendly loans or stock Business plan development Mentoring Civic engagement Conflict mediation, peace-building	The Support for Kosovo's Young Leaders (SKYL) programme targeted youth ages 15-26 from October 2008 through November 2011. The programme served 2,483 young people who have received training, leadership and negotiation skills. This initiative was funded by USAID and implemented by Mercy Corps and three local NGO partners.	The evaluation was conducted by Mercy Corps along with an external consultant. The evaluation found that 459 youth received follow on employment with outside employers. 12 businesses were started by youth and continued for at least 1 year. Participants planned and implemented 27 community projects which affected 11,600 people. Both, adults and youth report increased understanding among youth from different ethnic groups, an increase in life skills and employability skills, and better access to employment opportunities. Findings were not disaggregated by gender, but the programme had a high focus on inclusion of females.
NGO Landmine Action Programme – Liberia (USAID, 2013)	Apprenticeship or on-the-job training Classroom vocational training General training on entrepreneurship Life skills Vouchers Access to youth tailored loans or stock Basic education (numeracy, literacy) Psychosocial training or counselling	Landmine Action recruited ex-combatants and other high-risk youth and offered them several months of skills training and psychosocial counselling, along with a start-up package, to give youth a peaceful, sustainable, and legal alternative to illicit resource extraction, ease their reintegration into society, reduce the risk of their re-recruitment into crime and insurrection in the future, and improve security in hot-spot communities.	The evaluation conducted by Innovations for Poverty Action found that more than a year after completion of the program, participants were at least a quarter more likely to be engaged in agriculture, and almost a third more likely to have sold crops. There were no statistically significant changes in incomes between program participants and controls in average current income, employment, level of spending on food and household items, or savings. The average income reported is about $3 per month greater among program participants (a 2% increase) but the change is sufficiently small that we cannot say for sure that the impact is not zero. If we exclude program participants who specialized in poultry-raising, the results are relatively unchanged. No significant difference in the aggregate number of hours worked at any activity in the past month. The very top earners in the treatment group, however, do show more statistically significant higher earnings than the top earners in the control group. These agricultural enterprises are sustainable and profitable but their current revenue generation and employment generation is modest. The evaluation also found a small (3 percentage points) but not statistically significant decrease in participation in potentially illicit activities among the treatment group. Modest improvements were found in social engagement, citizenship, and stability for participants. Participants were less likely to have been interested by, or have participated in, the election violence in Cote d'Ivoire.

			Roughly half of program participants reported that the psychosocial training or one-on-one counselling was the part of the program that most changed their life. Qualitative data suggests a substantial change in confidence and less aggressive and risky behaviour. Females and males were equally likely to be engaged in agriculture, and the impact of the program is about the same for both genders. In terms of cost effectiveness, given scarce aid and resources for employment-generation, the most cost-effective means of expanding the returns to small holder commercial agriculture probably involves a shift in emphasis from skills training towards capital. More of both genders are clearly better per beneficiary, but the opportunity cost may be high in terms of other beneficiaries not served.
Youth Empowerment Program - Kenya, Nigeria, Senegal, Tanzania (USAID, 2013)	Job match and mediation Life skills General training on entrepreneurship	The Youth Empowerment Program aimed to improve the employability and civic engagement of disadvantaged African youth, ages 16 to 35, through the provision of demand-driven training in information and communications technology, life skills, entrepreneurship, and employment services. The programme was funded by Microsoft and implemented by IYF.	The evaluation conducted found that 61% of participants were placed in jobs by the program. Between 52% and 94% of youth surveyed found jobs (dependent or self-employment) and/or participated in internships, community service, or went back to school. 9% of program graduates surveyed were operating small businesses. Between 62% and 98% of participants in each of the follow-up evaluations believed that the ICT training positively affected their employment prospects. 90% rated their skills as high in areas including business plan development, bookkeeping/accounting, management, and marketing. Findings of the evaluation were not disaggregated by gender.
Timor-Leste Prepara Ami ba Serbisu (Prepare Us for Work) Project – Timor Leste (USAID, 2013)	Apprenticeship or on-the-job training Classroom vocational skills training Life skills Vouchers General training on entrepreneurship Business plan development Basic education Institutional capacity building	PAS served 2,000 people and responded to the particular developmental, learning and earning needs of out-of-school, minimally educated, low-skilled youth ages 15-29 in rural districts of Timor- Leste. Local institutions were also targeted for training and capacity building. The project was funded by USAID through EQUIP3.	The project performance evaluation conducted by Whalen, commissioned by EDC, found that 26% of participants had a contract job in the formal sector after the program and 20% of participants had started or improved an income-generating business after the program. Less than 1% had re-enrolled in an education program after the program. 3% had enrolled in further vocational training after the program. During focus groups, youth reported better self-esteem after the program.

			208 institutions participated and reported the following benefits: increased capacity to deliver a training program; increased financial management capacity; increased profile and reach into their target populations; improved linkages with other development partners in the district; and potential to register as a training provider. 127 (40%) of those who had a contract job in the formal sector after the programme were women. 98 (40%) of those who had started or improved an income-generating business after the programme were women.
Empowerment and livelihoods for adolescents (ELA) – Uganda (Youth Employment Inventory, 2014)	Life/ soft skills training Entrepreneurship training Advisory services (e.g. mentoring, business development services, or business formalization) Access to microfinance	The objective of the ELA programme is to empower adolescent girls both in terms of their entrepreneurial and business skills, and in terms of their social capacity. The aim is to build the girls' capacity to lead a life of self-reliance and dignity, and become active agents of social change in their own families and communities. Targeted exclusively at vulnerable teenage girls, the programme combines innovative livelihood and life skills training with a customised microfinance programme. Program components are as follows: (1) Adolescent Clubs; (2) Adolescent Leaders; (3) Life Skills Training Course; (4) Income Generation Skills Training; (5) Appropriately Designed Microfinance; (6) Community Participation. Organised into 500 'adolescent clubs' for 13 to 22 year olds, the programme provides a safe place for them freely socialise and share each other's experiences, as well as do daily team sports. The clubs and training courses are managed by the adolescents themselves.	Evaluation design consisted of a randomization into treatment and control at the village level (150 villages). Two types of treatments: T1 (50 villages): Adolescent Development Clubs + Training, T2 (50 villages): Adolescent Development Clubs + Training + Microfinance. Those who were not enrolled are 11% more likely to intend to go back to school. Impact on Life Skills: HIV knowledge improved by 11% relative to its baseline level among girls in targeted villages, girls in targeted villages are 7% more likely to know about pregnancy risk and 21% more likely to use a condom during sex. Impact on Health & Reproductive Outcomes: Girls in targeted villages are 14% less likely to have had sex unwillingly and 4% less likely to have children. They are equally likely to have had an STD but those who have an STD are 14% more likely to go to a health centre. Impact on Livelihood Skills: Self-assessed entrepreneurial ability is 10% higher among girls in targeted villages, Financial and analytical skills (as measured by survey questions) improved significantly among girls who participated in the program. Although the microfinance component has not been introduced yet, girls in targeted villages are 4% more likely to be engaged in an income generating activity, 5% more likely to be self-employed, and spend 16% more time working outside the house. Impact on Savings and Credit: Girls in targeted villages are 12% more likely to have savings, and their savings are 17% higher relative to

			baseline. Although the microfinance component has not been introduced yet, they are 3% more likely to have a loan.
Project Baobad – Kenya (Youth Employment Inventory, 2014)	Life/ soft skills training (in classroom and at the workplace) Entrepreneurship training Advisory services (e.g. mentoring, business development services, or business formalization) Access to microfinance	The main objective of Project Baobab is to educate and empower 1600 Kenyan youth to become successful entrepreneurs. Project Baobab achieves its objective by educating and empowering youth with skills they will need to start a small business. The project provides free education and entrepreneurial grants to youth, especially women, through a specialized life skills and business curriculum. Upon graduation, participants compete for $100 (USD) grants to fund their business idea.	As of December 2008, 1,000 students had completed the Project Baobab programme. Of those, over 300 were awarded micro-grants of USD 100 each. Each year, between 70 and 90 students graduated, with approximately 30% of the graduates receiving USD 100 grants for starting up new businesses. About 50% of the grantees are running businesses with good-to-marginal success. About 20% of the businesses are not operating (failed or discontinued for college).
Job Oriented Modular Training – (JOMT) - Kosovo (Youth Employment Inventory, 2014)	School-based technical and vocational education and training Supporting institutional capacity building of the education system for youth Financial support to trainees through training subsidies and access to credit (e.g. training vouchers)	JOMT cooperated with seven schools (Peja, Gjakova, Prizren, Kacanik, Viti, Gjilan, Kamenica). Major lines of action included the rehabilitation of workshops in host institutions; procurement of equipment; development, implementation and financing of modular courses. In cooperation with the partner schools, the project has developed and implemented the following (technical trades) training modules (occupational skills): automechanics; machinery shop; plumbing; electrical installation; tailoring; heating; carpentry; bricklaying; business, computing and English language; hairdressing; welding; computing; electro domestic repair; car painting; tailoring machine mechanics.	Results of an external evaluation found that in quantitative terms, with a total of 666 participants in 3 month courses, the quantitative target was exceeded; in qualitative terms, the project does continuous tracking of former trainees, and maintains a respective database. According to the data, the average employment rate of former trainees is 30 – 40% (the range for individual courses being from 0% to 100%). Project document does not define any indicators for employment (no benchmark to assess the achievement). Generally speaking, and taking other projects and overall concepts as reference, for the youth training, an employment rate of 50% is generally taken as success indicator for employability (not employment). Achievements as assessed by the external evaluation of the project in August 2003 highlight the development of 14 occupational areas; over 600 participants have attended modular courses, out of which about 40% are employed; in cooperation with the TITI in Nepal and the Institute of Pedagogical Studies in Albania, the project has trained curriculum development specialists, who are in a position to develop both short courses and frame curricula for long-term courses; the ministry is in the process to revise curricula for long-term courses. The curriculum development specialists trained by the project are involved in the process. In those occupational areas, where JOMT has developed modular courses, the developed modules served as model for the

			occupational training in the workshop; for the certification of modular training, the project was instrumental to bring the two ministries of education and labour together. The project initiative resulted in the establishment of a joint working group for the development of a national certification system. The joint working group also has planned to establish an Interim National Skills Board.
Skills Development for the Reconstruction and Recovery of Kosovo – Kosovo (Youth Employment Inventory, 2014)	In-classroom technical and vocational education and training Workplace training (e.g. internships, on-the-job training schemes) Non-formal apprenticeship schemes Enterprise-based technical and vocational training Entrepreneurship training Advisory services (e.g. mentoring, business development services, or business formalization) Access to microfinance Search assistance and access to labor market information Job counseling Job placement	The Project Skills Development for the Reconstruction and Recovery of Kosovo had an initial duration of three years, which was then extended through the donor's provision of additional funding. The project was implemented by the ILO in two distinct, albeit interconnected, phases that went beyond the originally planned timeframe. The first phase (2001 – mid 2004) supported the establishment of labour market institutions (i.e. the Ministry of Labour, the Public Employment Service and a network of eight regional training institutions), while the second (end 2004 – mid 2007) focused on the development of a youth employment policy and action plan, as well as on the piloting of active labour market programmes targeting disadvantaged youth. ☐ To maximize the employment impact of the reconstruction and recovery programmes, a provision was made for integrating demand-driven, employment-oriented training into the overall recovery strategy.	An evaluation of the programme shows that the overall number of people who had participated in competency-based training courses within the framework of the programme totalled 13,926 individuals. Approximately 80 percent of people who received training subsequently found work. All 164 counsellors and 50 registrars of the Kosovo employment services were trained in counselling and guidance techniques. Trained staff of the employment service had counselled approximately 126,000 unemployed. By September 2007, 1,953 individuals had participated in programmes on self-employment that lasted an average of three months, subsequently producing a business plan. The training material for 27 priority occupations produced by trainers was collected, systematized and published for daily use in the training centres. 4 Regional Vocational Training Centres, destroyed by the conflict, were refurbished and provided with modern equipment The Provisional Institutions of Self-Government (PISG) of Kosovo formally endorsed the Kosovo Youth Employment Action Plan in December 2006. A set of Guidelines for Public Employment Services (PES) staff has been produced. The competency-based training methodology was mainstreamed into the network of government as well as private providers that partnered with the Ministry.
Ninaweza Youth Empowerment Program – Kenya	In-classroom technical and vocational education and training	The Ninaweza Youth Empowerment Program is a comprehensive employability program for 700 young women living in six informal	An impact evaluation of the Ninaweza Youth Empowerment Program was coordinated by IYF under the Global Partnership for Youth Employment (GPYE) to test a comprehensive employability skills program model including life skills training and its impact on employability and income-

(Youth Employment Inventory, 2014)	Workplace training (e.g. internships, on-the-job training schemes) Life/ soft skills training (in classroom and at the workplace) Job placement	settlements surrounding Nairobi, Kenya: Kangemi, Kawangware, Kibera, Korogocho, Mathare and Mukuru. The purpose of this project is twofold: to improve the employability and income-generating capacity of disadvantaged young. The Ninaweza project was designed to provide young women with technical training in Information and Communication Technology (ICT), life skills training, work experience through internships, and job placement support.	generation of youth. School-to-School International (STS) conducted the impact evaluation that examined the effects of the program on youth employability in Kenya. The evaluation design is a randomized controlled trial (RCT) where participants are randomly selected from a list of applicants and assigned to either the treatment or control group. A sample of 1,510 participants was randomly assigned to one of three groups. (1) 350 participants in Treatment 1 received ICT training and life skills training, along with on-job experience through internships and job placement support. (2) 350 participants in Treatment 2 received ICT training, along with on-job experience through internships and job placement support. (3) 810 participants in the control group received none of the interventions. The impact evaluation established that the training component in ICT and Life skills of the Ninaweza program succeeded in providing those treated with technical knowledge in IT and knowledge of Life skills that otherwise they would not have acquired. The impact evaluation also established that among those who were not confident in their skill set, the program was successful in bolstering their confidence. Results: The RCT established that the eight-week Ninaweza training in ICT and life skills succeeded in increasing knowledge in both areas: The knowledge gain in the ICT test was 17.3%-points higher for Treatment 1 than Control and 15.8%-points greater for Treatment 2 than Control, and these gains were statistically significant; Those in Treatment 1 showed greater knowledge gain than those in Treatment 2 and Control on the life skills test and this increase was statistically significant (7.3%-points and 6.8%-points respectively). The RCT established that the Ninaweza program increased the likelihood of program participants obtaining a job: Those in Treatment 1 were 14% more likely to obtained jobs than those in the Control, and this difference was statistically significant. The RCT established that the Ninaweza program was successful in increasing the weekly income of the participants: The gains in weekly income were 445 KES higher for those in Treatment 1 than Control and 506 KES higher for those in Treatment 2 than in the Control and these differences were statistically different. The results on the life skills test suggested that Treatment 1 participants showed the largest gains on the kinds of life skills items that pertained to workplace behavior and searching for a job. The assessment conducted at the end-line suggested that Treatment group participants were more likely to apply for a job than their Control group counterparts, and that Treatment and Control group participants differed on the search method used for finding a job. Treatment group participants were more likely to review job advertisements, use

			recruiting agencies (or colleges), networks or attend an internship. Those in Treatment 1 were also more likely to attend internships than those in Treatment 2. The assessment conducted at the end-line suggested that Treatment group participants were more optimistic about their chances of finding quality employment than those in the Control group. The optimism was higher for those in Treatment 1 than it was for those in Treatment 2. The type of employment varied between these groups, with Treatment group participants being more likely to hold a full-time position and Control group participants being more likely to work as casual laborers. A higher proportion of respondents in Treatment 1 indicated that they received social benefits. The proportion of respondents that worked in the ICT sector (e.g. cyber cafes) was five times higher for those in Treatment
Program for the promotion of children and youth (PCY) -- Uganda (Youth Employment Inventory, 2014)	Life/ soft skills training (in classroom and at the workplace) Entrepreneurship training Advisory services (e.g. mentoring, business development services, or business formalization) Job counselling	PCY was implemented between 2003 and 2006, as a comprehensive approach to disadvantaged youth living in rural areas and currently un/underemployed. Comprehensive services for youth encompass: (1) promotion in areas of social work, (2) information and counseling, (3) entrepreneurship and self-employment activities, and (4) local skills development PCY also provided interventions for youth in conflict-affected areas as well as Internally Displaced Persons' camps.	A first impact evaluation in 2003/04 showed a positive trend with regard to income increases, i.e. the incomes of PCY participants were about 26% higher than those of other community members. Furthermore, for youth promoters/youth group members their main sources of income are from salaries (23%) and from youth group activities (38.5%) while other community members are still mainly engaged in subsistence farming (76%). The second impact evaluation with a control group was conducted in 2006. Youth promoters are less likely than their peers to rely primarily on subsistence economies and family support. Of the youth promoters interviewed 28.2% state subsistence economy and 10.3% family support as their main source of income, as opposed to 61.6% and 14% of respondents in the control group. Of the youth promoters 27.8% list youth group activities as their main source of income, in contrast to 4.3% of the control group. When comparing the promoters with the control group the following aspects can be highlighted: 26.6% of youth promoters state an average weekly income below UGX 4.000, as opposed to 50.1% of respondents from their peer group. 43% of promoters also state an average weekly income above UGX 8.000, as opposed to 29.6% of the control group. These disparities can be interpreted as an outcome of the higher diversity of income sources among the promoters, who rely less on subsistence and more on cash economies than their peers.

Technical and Vocational Vouchers Program (TVVP) -- Kenya (Youth Employment Inventory, 2014)	Financial support to trainees through training subsidies and access to credit (e.g. training vouchers)	The Technical and Vocational Vouchers Program (TVVP) was launched in 2008 to study the effect of vouchers on participation in vocational training programs and the short-term impact on job seekers' employment choices, jobs and incomes. Approximately 2,160 out-of-school youths (roughly 18 to 30 years old) applied for vocational education tuition vouchers, and a randomly selected half were awarded vouchers. Among voucher winners, a random half (approximately 530 students) were awarded a voucher that could only be utilized in public (government) vocational institutions, while the other half were awarded a voucher that could be used in both private and public schools. Each voucher is worth approximately USD 460, an amount sufficient to fully or almost fully cover tuition costs for both government and private vocational programs. The Technical and Vocational Vouchers Program collaborated with Youth Polytechnics under purview of the Kenyan Ministry of Youth, Technical Training Institutes under the Kenyan Ministry of Education and private vocational training institutions. 25% or 526 individuals received unrestricted vouchers. 25% or 529 individuals received	The evaluation showed that offering young adults vouchers that cover program costs does encourage young adults to enrol, and that those who can use the voucher for a private training program are more likely to sign up and stay in school. The initial evaluation does show that vouchers for vocational schools - especially when private sector schools are included - can be an effective way to give job seekers employable skills. The vouchers were very successful at getting young adults to enrol in vocational training programs. Seventy-four percent of participants who received vouchers enrolled in some type of vocational training, compared with less than four percent of those in the control group. Participants who received an unrestricted voucher - one that could be used for either a public or private training program - were more likely to enrol and less likely to drop-out of a program than those who received the restricted (public institution-only) voucher. Seventy-nine percent of people who received the unrestricted voucher attended a vocational training program, compared with 69 percent of those who received a voucher good only for government-run institutions. The 10 percentage point enrolment gap may be explained partly by the greater choice of schools available to holders of an unrestricted voucher. Voucher winners were not deterred from enrolling by information that contradicted their often inflated views about the wages they could receive after vocational training. Participants were overly optimistic in their projection of the effect of vocational training on income. On average, they believed that average returns (in the form of earnings) from training were 61 percent; in reality, the return would be around 37 percent. Being told this did not affect people's interest in applying to the program, nor did it affect enrolment among voucher winners. Voucher users' vocational training choices, by popularity: Tailoring (37 %), Mechanic (18 %), Hairdressing (9 %), Driving (7 %), Masonry (6 %). But women shown videos of women working in traditionally-male jobs, such as auto repair, and told that wages were higher in such fields, were more likely to use their vouchers differently. Given the information women were almost nine percentage points more likely to express interest in a male-dominated course (especially younger and more educated women) and 5 percentage points more likely to enrol. In terms of the short-run impact on participants' ability to find

	vouchers valid only for public institutions. 50% or 1,108 individuals did not receive vouchers.	work, anecdotal evidence indicates that those in a training program were able to find part-time work because of their enrolment. Most participants were still in school at the time of this survey, but anecdotal evidence collected during on-site visits to the schools indicated that students seemed to be recruited for part-time jobs in their fields of study.